

- (1) The Recommendation (Doc. # 211) is ADOPTED;
- (2) Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment (Doc. # 184) is GRANTED; and
- (3) Plaintiff's Motion to Exclude Certain Testimony by Janet Arrowsmith, M.D., (Doc. # 175), Plaintiff's Motion to Exclude Certain Testimony by Elias G. Chalhub, M.D. (Doc. # 177), Defendant's Motion to Preclude Expert Testimony by Michael D. Freeman, MedDr, MPH, FAAFS (Doc. # 186), Defendant's Motion to

Preclude Expert Testimony of Elizabeth Z. Naftalis, M.D. (Doc. # 188), and Defendant's Motion to Preclude Expert Testimony of Laura M. Plunkett, PhD, DABT (Doc. # 190) are DENIED as moot.

Final judgment will be entered separately.

DONE this 26th day of April, 2018.

/s/ W. Keith Watkins
CHIEF UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE